



## **Santa Clara Community Working Group Meeting**

**Date of Meeting:** September 15, 2016 (4:00 p.m. to 6:00 p.m.)

### **Attendees:**

Members in Attendance: Jack Morash, Sudhanshu Jain, John Urban

Members not in Attendance: Ron Miller, Steve Buress, Rahul Chandhok, Denise Harris, Chris Lepe, Richard Fedesco, Chris Shay

Other Speaker Attendees: Val Menotti (BART)

Project Team in Attendance: Leyla Hedayat (VTA), Kevin Kurimoto (VTA), Angela Sipp (VTA), Erica Roecks (VTA), Janice Soriano (VTA), Samantha Swan (VTA), Brent Pearse (VTA), John Davidson (City of Santa Clara), Eileen Goodwin (Apex Strategies)

**Location:** Historic Railroad Society, 1005 Railroad Avenue in Santa Clara, CA

### **Summary:**

#### **The Meeting agenda included:**

- Welcome and Introductions
- Follow Up Items – Facilitator
- Schedule Update – VTA Staff
- Work Plan Update – Facilitator
- City Related Projects Update – Santa Clara Staff
- FTA Process: New Starts Funding – VTA Staff
- Impact of Transit on Station Area Communities – BART Staff
- Lessons Learned from Phase I – VTA Staff
- Outreach Poll Results – VTA Staff
- Next Steps – Facilitator
- Review Action Items
- Next Meeting Date (November 17, 2016 4 p.m.-6 p.m.) – Location: Historic Railroad Society, 1005 Railroad Avenue in Santa Clara – Facilitator

**Key Issues/Comments/Questions:**

<b>Comment/Question</b>	<b>Response</b>
<b>Follow Up Items/Schedule</b>	
What does S stand for in SEIS?	Supplemental
<b>City Projects Update</b>	
You talk about City Center and City Place is that intended to be the new downtown?	The City Place development is intended to be more of a regional destination. The City has planned additional planning efforts for the existing downtown area around Benton and the Franklin Mall area.
Wasn't the area around the BART Station supposed to develop into a downtown district? How does City Place impact the Caltrain/BART Station area?	You bring up a good point. This is likely addressed in the City Place EIR, but perhaps the City should look to refresh its General Plan to account for the impacts of the City Place development.
If you build one downtown area then all the traffic will go there. It is better to have many smaller downtown districts, some that serve the neighborhoods such as Franklin Mall and others that serve the region such as City Place.	City Place will be like Santana Row in quality only five times the size. Santa Clara Square would be more neighborhood serving.
What is the impact of City Place on BART ridership?	The expectations should be consistent with the General Plan and Station Area Plan assumptions.
There are ridership numbers for the ACE train in the City Place EIR, can you speak to those?	I cannot.
What agencies are speaking about double tracking?	ACE and Capitol Corridor.
<b>FTA Process: New Starts Funding</b>	
Does the budget for New Starts and transit funding change depending upon	It can but any appropriations also have to make their way through Congress as well.

which party controls the White House?	
What year did Phase I get its FFGA and how many years later was the groundbreaking?	VTA received the FFGA in March 2012 one month prior to groundbreaking in April 2012. Some FTA funded projects may take longer between FFGA and groundbreaking, it depends on how much engineering and design has already be completed by the agency. It should be noted that although the FFGA calls for \$900M to come to the project, the money is flowing at approximately \$130M a year. VTA has been able to go through the process very quickly because of the local funding available. Local money really moves the needle for the FTA.
Have the cost estimates increased?	No they have not.
What are the impacts of the cap and trade on the funding plan?	VTA is planning to have \$750M from the cap and trade funds go toward funding BART. That said, VTA is aware of the current issues surrounding that funding. VTA has other funding sources that could be used to fill gaps if the full amount from cap and trade is not received. Those plans have been previously presented to the CWGs by VTA's Finance staff and consultant team.
<b>Impact of Transit on Station Area Communities – BART</b>	
Is the 15% increase in real estate value statistic controlled for everything but the proximity to BART?	Yes, that was the intention when the study was done.
Was that study just for BART properties?	The study you are referring to was for many TOD properties not just ones close to BART. Here is the link:  <b>Travel Characteristics of Transit-Oriented Development in California (2004)</b> Statewide report showing travel patterns, demographics, and parking ratios of residents and workers in selected TOD projects near rail stations in California.  <a href="http://www.bart.gov/sites/default/files/docs/Travel_of_TOD.pdf">http://www.bart.gov/sites/default/files/docs/Travel_of_TOD.pdf</a>
Were there apartments studied?	No not in those studies.
Does BART Track Santa Clara County?	No. There have been other studies that were done related to the VTA LRT system.  <b>Rail Transit's Value-Added: Effects of Proximity to Light and Commuter Rail Transit on Commercial Land Values in Santa Clara County, California (Cervero / Duncan, 2001)</b>

	<p>Analysis of commercial land value capitalization of proximity to light rail in Santa Clara County.</p> <p><a href="http://www.vta.org/bart/PhaseIICWGs">www.vta.org/bart/PhaseIICWGs</a> and click on “<b>Rail Transit’s Value-Added (by Cervero/Duncan)</b>” under Phase II CWG Links on the right side</p>
<p>In Northern Virginia there has been a lot of very tall development and office buildings springing up around the heavy rail transit stations. I want data that is helpful to sell the BART project to the community.</p>	<p>Yes. Northern Virginia has a lot of interesting TOD. Here is a link to a relevant study about heavy rail:</p> <p><b>Effects of TOD on Housing, Parking, and Travel (Transit Cooperative Research Program / TCRP)</b>  National study of TOD projects near rail stations in select regions across the country - including BART stations. Includes comparison of trip rates and parking ratios against ITE standards.</p> <p><a href="http://www.tcrponline.org/PDFDocuments/TCRP_RPT_128.pdf">http://www.tcrponline.org/PDFDocuments/TCRP_RPT_128.pdf</a></p> <p>There is a relevant APTA study as well. Here is the link:</p> <p><a href="http://www.apta.com/resources/statistics/Documents/NewRealEstateMantra.pdf">http://www.apta.com/resources/statistics/Documents/NewRealEstateMantra.pdf</a></p>
<p>What is in the BART farebox number? And more importantly what isn’t in that 74% to make that such a high number?</p>	<p>Yes, the farebox number covers operations, staffing and light maintenance of vehicles. This methodology follows industry-wide standards. Here is the farebox return methodology information from the BART Budget documents link:</p> <p><b>BART FY17 Preliminary Budget Memo</b>  See p. 4 for income statement, and Sections 4 and 5 for details. The draft is not updated in detail for the final budget.</p> <p><a href="http://www.bart.gov/sites/default/files/docs/FY17%20PBM%20Final_0.pdf">http://www.bart.gov/sites/default/files/docs/FY17%20PBM%20Final_0.pdf</a></p> <p><b>2) BART FY17 Adopted Budget</b>  Final budget is in the BART Board agenda packet, item #5D.</p> <p><a href="http://www.bart.gov/sites/default/files/docs/agendas/06-09-16%20Agenda%20%20Packet_0.pdf">http://www.bart.gov/sites/default/files/docs/agendas/06-09-16%20Agenda%20%20Packet_0.pdf</a></p>
<p>What is the square footage around the Transbay terminal? I am trying to get a handle on the “BART factor.”</p>	<p>The Transbay area was rezoned for 5m additional square feet of office space. It is difficult to isolate the BART factor because of the other transit service from MUNI.</p>
<p>Was Fruitvale rental?</p>	<p>Yes.</p>

I want to see next phase of the BART Station areas be even more dense. It is good it is rental because then BART and or others can redo it at some future date with a denser product.	The second phase at Fruitvale is much more dense than the first. It is expected to be five stories high. It is much more expensive for the developer above five stories due to construction material requirements.
What is the parking ratio of these developments?	Local governments set the parking requirements, not BART. BART prefers low ratios. BART has found that the Pleasant Hill Station is generating a high ridership from the adjacent residential. The Cervero study also has covered this information here is the link:  <b>Rail Transit's Value-Added: Effects of Proximity to Light and Commuter Rail Transit on Commercial Land Values in Santa Clara County, California (Cervero / Duncan, 2001)</b> Analysis of commercial land value capitalization of proximity to light rail in Santa Clara County.  <a href="http://www.vta.org/bart/PhaseIICWGs">www.vta.org/bart/PhaseIICWGs</a> and click on "Rail Transit's Value-Added (by Cervero/Duncan)" under Phase II CWG Links on the right side
How are BART riders getting to the stations? Are they walking?	As density has increased near the stations BART has observed more walking and bike rider as a mode shift.
Where do they park?	BART just added 100,000 riders last year yet only 1,000 more parking spaces were added to the system. The access mode has changed dramatically with more people walking to stations now. This behavior change has also been inspired by BART's decision to charge for parking which it didn't do years ago.
<b>Lessons Learned from Phase I</b>	
When after the money is available could construction start?	Utility work (which will involve large trucks and noticeable roadwork) will likely start in second quarter 2017.
Is the real estate reserved for the project already?	Not in all cases but VTA does control some large important pieces of real estate such as the Newhall Yard and the Mitchell Block (bounded by Market Street, Santa Clara Street, First Street and Saint John Street) in downtown San Jose.
VTA has the power to use eminent domain and has used it on other projects.	That is correct.
The Newhall Yard is	Comment noted.

worth in excess of \$100M, I believe there is a better use for that land and that is TOD.	
Will the tunnel start at Newhall or at Alum Rock and go at the same time?	One direction is likely, we do not yet know from which portal the contractor would start the work, and to leave the most flexibility for the contractor, we're evaluating it in the environmental document to start at both ends.
<b>Outreach Poll Results</b>	
Does Google maps have the capacity to show road closures and detours?	Yes, it does.
How does that happen in advance of the work? It would be nice to get a warning.	VTA works directly with Google to make that happen. VTA learned in Phase I of the project that Google can change their algorithm if they know about road closures, etc. in advance. Transbay also does a nice job communicating this information. <a href="http://transbaycenter.org/construction-updates/construction-activity-map">http://transbaycenter.org/construction-updates/construction-activity-map</a>  VTA's Google Phase I Construction Map: <a href="http://www.vta.org/bart/map">http://www.vta.org/bart/map</a>
<b>Review Action Items</b>	
What is the ballpark for the opening?	2026
Will heavy construction be about seven years then?	Yes, construction moves around and the last year in the schedule is for testing the vehicles on the line, so about seven years of construction activity should be in the ballpark
What is the acreage of Las Plumas compared to the Newhall Yard?	Las Plumas is approximately 24 acres. Newhall Yard is approximately 62 acres.

**Follow-Up Items:**

- BART to provide links to various studies for use in the meeting summary above. (See above)
- VTA to provide link to APTA study for meeting summary above. (See above)
- BART to provide link to farebox return methodology information from the BART Budget document. (See above)
- Put the acreage of Las Plumas compared to the Newhall Yard in the meeting notes. (See above)

**Prepared by:** Eileen Goodwin, Apex Strategies

**Distribution:**

CWG  
Project Team  
City Staff  
Distribution list